

Summary of the final report on Evaluation of Czech official development cooperation in the water and sanitation sector in Moldova

Evaluation purpose

The main purpose of this evaluation is to obtain independent, well-founded and consistent findings, conclusions and recommendations, which can be used by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) and by the Czech Development Agency (CZDA) for decision-making on future direction and implementation modalities of the Czech Official Development Assistance (ODA) in Moldova in the water and sanitation sector.

The main objective is to assess Czech ODA activities in water and sanitation sector in Moldova with the emphasis on their long-term impacts, sustainability and potential for replication and continuity.

Brief description of evaluated interventions and the evaluation context

The overall assessment is based on the evaluation of four implemented projects and the sector programme with respect to the situation in the water and sanitation sector in Moldova. Conclusions and recommendations take into consideration priorities of Moldavian strategic documents, Czech ODA and sectoral focus of other donors active in Moldova. The evaluated projects were financed from Czech ODA and coordinated by the CZDA. The first two projects concern the removal of environmental burdens; the second and third projects sanitation.

Brief description of evaluated projects:

<i>Project number and name</i>	<i>Period</i>	<i>Place</i>	<i>Implementing organisation</i>	<i>Total project value</i>	<i>Main project outputs</i>
1. Remediation of Contamination by Oil Substance from the former Soviet Airbase Marculesti	2010 - 2012	Lunga and Marculesti	DEKONTA, a.s.	799.630 EUR ¹	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Feasibility study on pollution remediation • Two remediation stations in operations • Feasibility study on modernization of water pipeline and rehabilitation of sewage in Lunga municipality
2. Remediation of Environmental Burdens caused by Pesticides in Moldova	2011 - 2013	Clocusna, Gradinita, Ciobalaccia		568.890 EUR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 200 t of pesticides removed from 3 localities • Assessment of environmental and health risks caused by the residual contamination; presentation to citizens of the municipalities
3. Rehabilitation of the Waste Water Treatment Plant (WWTP) in Vulcanesti	2010 - 2013	Vulca-nesti	Ircon, s.r.o. and Topol Water, s.r.o.	754.815 EUR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Completion of testing operation of the rehabilitated WWTPs and pumping stations • Awareness raising campaign about water management in schools • Long-term plan for development of Water supply and sanitation
4. Rehabilitation of WWTP in Cimislia	2011 - 2015	Cimislia		835.185 EUR	

Development cooperation (DC) program with Moldova for the period 2011 - 2017 forms the basis for current bilateral DC between the Czech Republic and Moldova. Water supply and sanitation (WSS) belong to priorities of this program. The four goals within this priority include the focus areas of the evaluated projects, i.e. cooperation in the areas of sanitation and the removal of environmental burdens.

CZDA elaborated an outline of program for development cooperation between the Czech Republic and Moldova in the water supply and sanitation sector for the period 2015 - 2017 and after 2017. This outline

¹ Exchange rate 27CZK/EUR

does not contain any specific objectives, assumptions, or indicators. The evaluation report therefore contains possible scenario of the sectoral program logic in the form of the theory of change.

The evaluation team

The evaluation was carried out by BP Consult, s. r. o. The evaluation team members are:

- Monika Přibylová - lead evaluator
- Marie Körner - methodology support and quality assurance
- Jan Pacák - expert for remediation geology and hydrogeology
- Ondřej Babor - expert for hydrogeology
- Petr Prockert - expert for waste water treatment technologies
- Gabriel Profir - local coordinator

Key findings and conclusions in relation to the Terms of Reference

Findings and conclusions are based on the evaluation of four projects and sectoral aspects. Assessment of relevance is based on relevance of individual evaluated projects and on relevance of the Sectoral program in relation to Moldavian strategic documents. Effectiveness was evaluated on the basis of actual contribution of each project to fulfilment of its objectives and outputs. Sustainability, impacts, efficiency and cross cutting principles were assessed based on findings and conclusions related to individual projects. It was not possible to assess the efficiency within the sector, since there is no sector program budget. The evaluation of CZ ODA visibility considered the visibility of individual projects on local level as well as on national level. Relations and synergies between projects were evaluated based on mutual comparison of their goals and outputs. Evaluation findings and conclusions related to individual projects are listed in annexes 2 – 5 to the evaluation report; sectoral findings and conclusions are contained in chapter 4.

Summary evaluation of the four projects

Evaluation criteria		Rate of fulfilment of the evaluated criteria				Summary evaluation
		Research of oil substances contamination	Removal of pesticides	WWTP reconstruction		
				Cimislia	Vulcanesti	
Relevance		High	High	High	High	High
Effectiveness		Rather high	Rather high	Rather low	Rather high	Rather high
Efficiency		Rather high	Rather low	Rather low	Rather low	Rather low
Sustainability		Rather low	Rather high	Rather low	Rather low	Rather low
Impacts		Rather low	High	High	High	Rather high
Cross cutting principles	Good governance	Rather low	Rather high	Rather low	Rather high	Rather high
	Environment & climate	Rather high	High	High	High	High
	Human rights & gender	Rather high	Rather high	Rather high	Rather high	Rather high
Follow up activities		Rather high	High	Rather high	Rather high	Rather high
Visibility of CZ ODA		Rather high	High	High	High	High

Summary of Sectoral program evaluation

Sectoral aspects	Rate of fulfilment
Linkages among the evaluated projects	Rather low
Sectoral DC program relevance in relation to Moldavian strategic documents	Rather high
Synergy of impacts of the evaluated projects	Rather low
Relevance of projects in relation to CZ ODA programs	High
Relevance with real needs in the sector	High
Level of communication and coordination between actors of the CZ ODA	Rather low
Level of communication and coordination with other donors in the sector	Rather high
Cooperation with partner organisations and actors in the sector	On local level - Rather high, On national level - Rather low
Follow up activities and cooperation in the sector (commercial follow up, cooperation in the frame of CZ ODA)	Rather high

Summary conclusions on selected key criteria

Communication and coordination between Czech CZ ODA actors, Moldavian partners, and other donors active in Moldova; potential for multilateral projects

Each implementer coordinated project activities with local and national partners separately. In case of need, the implementer utilized Czech Embassy or CZDA. Communication and coordination with Moldavian partners on local level was usually very good, depending on how the project activities contributed to solving priority concerns of the local authorities. Communication and coordination with Moldavian partners on national level depended on management of the respective institutions and continuity of their employees. The coordination, communication and cooperation with the representatives of the Ministry of Environment (MoE) were difficult in the last several years (except for POPs SMO). Reasons included frequent changes in the MoE management and its priorities, as well as small number of experts experienced in project management in the middle management of these institutions. Improvement of planned and ongoing projects' coordination in the water and sanitation sector belongs to the current MoE's priorities.

Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC) acts as the umbrella organisation for the coordination of donor activities in the water and sanitation sector. SDC organizes regular donors meetings and follow up meetings with the MoE. Regional projects in the area of water supply and sanitation are coordinated by the Ministry of Regional Development through Regional development agencies. This coordination is flexible and contributes to successful realisation of projects. Majority of smaller donors (e.g. ADA, RoAid) coordinate their activities in this sector with other donors in the form of trilateral or multilateral projects. This cooperation proves to be effective especially in the cases of multiple requirements for modernisation and construction of water and sewage infrastructure at the rayon or regional levels. Bigger donors (e.g. GIZ) are focussed on support of regional water supply and sewage systems.

Sustainability and efficiency

Projects sustainability is assessed on the edge between rather low and rather high. The sustainability of the project "Remediation of Contamination by oil substances" has improved due to a CZ ODA funded follow up project. Nevertheless, the MoE's approach towards outputs acceptance and financing the remediation operation during and after the end of the evaluated project indicated rather low sustainability. According to the information from the end of October 2015, it is expected to improve the MoE's approach towards ensuring the operation of installed remediation technology.

Sustainability of projects in the area of WWTP reconstruction is influenced by high operational costs of water supply, sewage and WWTP systems, connection of about 40 % municipal population and related low inflow of waste waters in WWTPs (in comparison to the planned inflow), and insufficient funds for water piping and sewage network modernisation and expansion. Sustainability and efficiency of these projects can be increased by widening the scope of preparatory activities (e.g. preparation of feasibility study incl. verification of the technical and economic figures) before the actual project starts, and/or cooperation with other donors in order to fund bigger projects, which would include also modernisation and enlargement of water pipes and sewage networks.

Impacts

Projects' impacts in the sanitation area are assessed as high, because of the significant decrease of waste water pollution being discharged to rivers. Another impact of these projects is introduction or expansion of the environmental education in two schools in each town based on the awareness raising campaign implemented within the evaluated projects.

Impacts of the project focused on research of oil substances contamination were assessed as rather low, because the project purpose was not properly defined (activities focused on pollution research cannot achieve significant decrease of this pollution). Impact of the project aimed at removal of pesticides is assessed as high, because significant sources of pollution risk for ground and surface waters, soil and air were removed on three localities. The population of these localities was also informed about health risks of pesticides, which contributes to increased awareness about their harmful effect and reduction of their further use.

Recommendations

The following table contains the overview of recommendations with the highest importance and urgency. Additional recommendations are listed in the chapter 5 of the Evaluation Report.

Sectoral area	Recommendation for sectoral and project themes	Addressee
Oil substances contamination Remediation	Establish system for management and long term financing for the oil substances contamination remediation in localities Lunga and Marculesti	MoE
Pesticides contamination remediation	Ensure financing for remediation of cleared storages and their surroundings to eliminate remaining risk of contamination	MoE (POPs SMO)
Oil substances contamination Remediation	Continue to support implementation of follow up phase of oil substances contamination remediation from CZ ODA	CZDA
Sanitation	Cooperate with other donors on sanitation projects	CZDA
Pesticides contamination remediation	Secure cleared storages against unauthorised manipulation with contaminated structures (ruins)	Local authority (LA) Gradinita and Clocusna
Sanitation	Ensure construction adaptation of the 2 nd pumping station for installation of new technology	LA Cimisia
Sanitation	Ensure transparent environment between operator, owner and clients of the WSS system	LA Cimisia and Vulcanesti
Sanitation	Change operation of WWT technology from two to one reactor	WSS operators in Cimisia and Vulcanesti
Sanitation	Continue in preparation of the project for modernisation and construction of WSS infrastructure	LA Vulcanesti
Whole sector	Continue to support water and sanitation sector either on geographically limited territories or in the areas, where the CR has comparative advantage over other donors	MFA
System/ process area	System and process recommendations	Addressee
Sector program and tender documentation	Design theory of change for the sector program and on its basis prepare theory of change for individual projects as a basis for tender documentation	CZDA
Identification	Clearly define project objectives	CZDA
Formulation	Focus on verification of key parameters during preparation of the technical assignment	CZDA
Monitoring	Assessment of risks and assumptions during project implementation needs to be reflected in project reports	Implementing organisations and CZDA
System	Development expert of the Embassy on full time basis for the support of identification, monitoring and coordination CZ ODA projects	MFA